

20 February 2024



Future Melbourne Committee
City of Melbourne

6 Parliament Place
East Melbourne
VIC 3002

Email: conservation@natrtrust.com.au

Web: www.nationaltrust.org.au

Submitted online

T 03 9656 9818

Re: Future Melbourne Committee Agenda Items 6.1 Ministerial Planning Referral: TPMR-2023-7 and 6.2 Ministerial Planning Referral: TPMR-2023-10 Queen Victoria Market 65-159 Victoria Street, Melbourne.

Dear Councillors,

The National Trust of Australia (Victoria) (National Trust) provides the following submission to the above planning referrals for an early works planning permit application and the proposed Queen Victoria Market (QVM) Southern Precinct Development Plan, December 2023.

The National Trust has a long-standing interest in the City of Melbourne's Queen Victoria Market Precinct Renewal Program and has been actively engaged in the process for many years, including as a member of the Queen Victoria Market People's Panel in 2018. The National Trust recognises the Queen Victoria Market's national significance as one of the great nineteenth century markets of Victoria. It has been in continuous operation since the 1870s and is the only Melbourne market to survive from a group of important central markets built by the City of Melbourne Corporation.

We also recognise the social significance of the Queen Victoria Market as a record of change and continuity in market activity over a long period and as an important shopping, leisure and meeting place for generations of Victorians and visitors to Melbourne. The complex of enclosed food halls, open sheds, shops, and stores perpetuates distinctive forms of trading, providing a very tangible continuity from the nineteenth century to the present. The social significance of the Market is reflected in its function as an affordable and diverse retail market serviced by small, independent businesses, from many different cultural backgrounds.

Furthermore, the Old Melbourne Cemetery is located underneath the current at grade carpark and is recognised through the edge of the Franklin Street Stores which are built on this alignment. It is Melbourne's first official cemetery, established in 1837, and is of archaeological significance as many burials remain on the site.

The National Trust advocates for the values of both the Market and Old Melbourne Cemetery to be maintained during and after the Market Renewal process. In particular, we expect the open character of the Market sheds to be maintained, and for the market to continue to be an affordable place to shop for locals and visitors.

1.0 Summary of National Trust Position

In 2017 the National Trust conditionally supported the Queen Victoria Market Precinct Renewal. The National Trust continues to consult with the Market Renewal team to provide input and advocate for positive heritage outcomes on the site.

We acknowledge that this permit application seeks to implement key outcomes that were terms of the 2014 agreement between the City of Melbourne and the State Government as part of the Market Renewal. We also recognise that the proposal is subject to the requirements of a Development Plan Overlay (DPO11), Design and Development Overlay and outcomes of the Queen Victoria Market Precinct Renewal Master Plan.

The National Trust recognises that funds secured through the development of the Southern Development Site will be reinvested into the Queen Victoria Market as part of the Queen Victoria Market Precinct Renewal Program. While we acknowledge the precinct benefits to be delivered by this development, the National Trust believes these benefits do not require the cost of the Market's integrity as a site of rare significance in a location of the CBD that has to date been distinguished by its relatively low-density surrounds, enabling public appreciation of its intactness and distinguished role.

- We support the proposal for the replacement of the open-air carpark with Market Square. However, we have concerns regarding certainty around the design and consultation process for this new public open space, and the excising effect on the Franklin Street Stores from the rest of the Market site.
- We support the proposed adaptive reuse of the Franklin Street Stores. However, we object to the temporary and permanent demolition of the canopy to facilitate the encroachment and cantilever of the tower developments behind the Stores.
- We object to the scale of development proposed behind the Franklin Street Stores. We submit that the bulk, height and encroachment of the proposed towers on the Stores overwhelms the Market. It is our position that these elements must be reduced to minimise the impacts of the new development on the state and national heritage values of the Market complex.

2.0 Ministerial Planning Referral: TPMR-2023-10 Early works permit application

With regard to the application for early works associated with the redevelopment of the site being concurrently considered under development plan application DP2302292 (CoM ref TPMR-2023-7). We submit that early works should not be considered until the key matters of the Queen Victoria Market (QVM) Southern Precinct Development Plan have been fully resolved and the plan finally approved. Approval of works and planning for this significant site should not be driven by pre-determined outcomes.

3.0 Ministerial Planning Referral: TPMR-2023-7 Queen Victoria Market (QVM) Southern Precinct Development Plan, December 2023

We acknowledge that in light of the Heritage Victoria permit approval, heritage is not a required consideration for the Committee. However, we implore the Committee to view this site and the proposed changes in a holistic manner, accounting for all significant values to the Melbourne and Victorian community.

We note that the [Heritage Victoria Officers Report](#) concerning this permit application states, 'It is a poor heritage outcome that a place of State and National significance should have to be physically altered to allow for an improved development outcome, however in this case there is little alternative.'

3.1 Public Realm

The National Trust conditionally supports the proposal for the replacement of the open-air carpark with Market Square. While we acknowledge that the design of Market Square is subject to change based on City of Melbourne led community consultation, we have concerns regarding certainty around the proposed design, particularly with the shared one effectively excising the Franklin Street Stores from the rest of the Market site.

We therefore approve of the Shared Zone Design Principle 3,

The north-south crossings for laneway pedestrians that should denote pedestrian priority and ensure that the shared zone is not a barrier between the Southern Development Site and the activation of the northern tenancy areas of the Franklin Street Stores, Market Square and the Market.

We submit that the detailed design for Market Square and the treatment of the shared zone should ensure that the Franklin Street boundary can continue to be read as the southern extent of the Market, rather than the public open space visually excising the Franklin Street Stores from the rest of the Market site.

We would seek more detail and certainty regarding the Ground Plane Design Principle 2,

Provide for a continuous north-south connection between Franklin Street, Market Square and the Market. Where possible, the view lines through this space at ground level should not be obscured.

This Principle should go further to guarantee that a connection between the Franklin Street stores to the Market will be maintained in the design of both the shared zone and Market Square.

We also seek greater transparency regarding what design elements of Market Square are subject to change through the City of Melbourne led community consultation. It is not clear what level of public interpretation of the Old Melbourne Cemetery will be expected. While this element may not be the concern of the Southern Precinct Development Plan, the National Trust encourages ongoing meaningful community consultation on how the history of the site is to be acknowledged to engage and raise public interest in the archaeological significance of the Old Melbourne Cemetery site.

3.2 Landscape Design

The National Trust supports the vision and principles of the Market Square landscape design. We acknowledge that species selection has not been finalised and Traditional Owners will be consulted.

3.3 Franklin Street Stores

The National Trust supports the adaptive reuse of heritage buildings to ensure they have an ongoing purpose and remain viable assets to their communities. We generally

support the plans to adaptively re-use the Franklin Street Stores, and the required conservation works and removal of non-original fabric to facilitate this.

However, we have serious concerns with the removal of the Franklin Street Stores canopy as part of the development of the T1 and T2 towers. We disagree with the comments in the delegate report that this constitutes a 'high level of retention of the Franklin Street Stores' (Page 42 of 45).

We are not satisfied that the demolition and partial removal of the Franklin Street Stores' canopy has been sufficiently justified. Demolition of original fabric should be avoided, and retention of some significant fabric is not a justification for demolition elsewhere.

3.3 Tower developments

Regarding the proposed tower developments behind the Franklin Street Stores, we submit that,

- the height of the proposed towers should be reduced to mitigate the overwhelming nature of their mass;
- the separation between each tower should be increased to mitigate the cumulative bulk and walled effect of the three towers;
- the development should be further set back from the Franklin Street Stores and not cantilever over them, which it has been argued necessitates the partial demolition of the Stores' canopy.

3.3.1 Impact of height and bulk

The National Trust objects to the proposed bulk and massing of the tower developments behind the Franklin Street Stores, as they overwhelm the Market and would result in an unacceptable and unreasonable impact on the significance of the registered place.

The National Trust finds that both the intactness of the Franklin Street Stores and the ability to appreciate the noted architectural elements of the Market would be threatened by the height and bulk of the proposed tower developments encroaching on the Stores.

We find that the height and proximity of the three towers creates a wall effect on the Franklin Street boundary which overwhelms the Franklin Street Stores and looms over the rest of the Market.

Furthermore, we fundamentally disagree that large-scale development on the fringes of the Market will not diminish its intactness and legibility as an early market complex. The overwhelming nature of this proposed development, and the encroachment and cantilever over the Franklin Street Stores, prevents the appreciation of these structures in their own right. We also submit that these towers will impact the wider site and its important value as a distinct market complex due to the significant impact on the traditionally low scale density sightlines of the site. Additionally, the transition from the higher built form of the central city to the very low scale of the Market will be starkly disrupted if these tower developments are approved.

To mitigate these negative impacts, the height and bulk of the proposed towers should be reduced, and their separation, and setback from the Franklin Street Stores increased.

3.3.2 Impact of the cantilever

The National Trust objects to the cantilever of T1 and T2 over the Franklin Street Stores. We acknowledge the proposed cantilever is not as extensive as DPO11 allows, however, we submit that just because it is not as extensive as it could be, this does not make the cantilever a good design outcome.

The National Trust also disagrees that the Franklin Street Stores are provided with sufficient breathing space from the cantilevered parts of T1 and T2. We submit that necessitating the demolition of the canopies would indicate the cantilever produces an overwhelming effect on the Franklin Street Stores, in that elements of their built fabric must be removed to accommodate the towers.

We submit that the design of the cantilever over the Franklin Street Stores should be removed from the development proposal.

4.0 Conclusion

We respectfully request that the Future Melbourne Committee refuse to support either application TPMR-2023-7 or TPMR-2023-10 in their current forms.

We encourage the City of Melbourne to oppose the partial demolition of the Franklin Street Stores canopy, as well as the height, bulk and cantilever of the proposed tower developments, on the basis they would have an adverse and irreversible impact on the significance of the Queen Victoria Market.

For any enquiries regarding this submission, please get in touch with this office on 03 9656 9844 or with me directly at samantha.westbrooke@nattrust.com.au.

Yours sincerely,



Samantha Westbrooke

Executive Manager - Conservation and Advocacy
National Trust of Australia (Victoria)